

Book Review: “Quantum Theory as an Emergent Phenomenon” by Stephen L. Adler

Cambridge University Press (2004)

Angelo Bassi*

Mathematisches Institut der Universität München,
Theresienstr. 39, 80333 München, Germany, and
The Abdus Salam International Centre for Theoretical Physics,
Strada Costiera 11, 34014 Trieste, Italy.

Stephen Adler’s new book, “Quantum Theory as an Emergent Phenomenon”, is intriguing already from the title: why should one consider quantum mechanics, our most successful physical theory which has been confirmed by all experiments performed up to now, not as a fundamental theory of nature but rather as an effective theory emerging from a deeper level of dynamics? Of course, here we are not referring just to a specific quantum mechanical model but to the general mathematical structure of quantum theory, where states of physical systems are represented by vectors of suitable Hilbert spaces, observables by linear operators and the dynamics by a linear equation for the vectors.

Indeed, there is a deep fundamental reason why quantum theory as it stands can not be our ultimate theory, which goes under the name of the *measurement problem*. Due to the *linearity* of quantum mechanics, microscopic systems can be easily prepared in a superposition of two different states, and when they interact with macroscopic objects, as it happens e.g. in a measurement process, they easily generate a superposition of two macroscopically different states of the macro-object. The question is: why do we not see such kind of macroscopic superpositions? Why do macroscopic objects seem to be always well localized in space? The standard answer to these questions is provided by the Copenhagen interpretation, according to which when a micro-system interacts with a macro-object and creates a superposition of different macroscopic states, the unitary evolution given by the Schrödinger equation is immediately followed by a reduction process which randomly drives the superposition into one of its terms, with a probability distribution given by the Born rule. This is the so called *postulate of wavepacket reduction* which should explain both the fact that measurements on quantum systems always have definite outcomes and the probability of such outcomes.

Thus, the Copenhagen interpretation is in deep conflict with our idea that a unique type of evolution should at least in principle rule all types of physical processes; worse than that, it does not tell us in a clear, precise and unambiguous way under which circumstances a system evolves according only to the Schrödinger equation and in which other cases also wavepacket reduction occurs. The problem of understanding quantum theory is then still open.

*e-mail: bassi@mathematik.uni-muenchen.de

The measurement problem is the starting point of Adler's book, and the solution he proposes is the following: *quantum mechanics* is not a fundamental theory of nature but *an emergent phenomenon arising from the statistical mechanics of matrix models with a global unitary invariance*. The book is entirely devoted to showing how that idea can be implemented within a concrete (and highly sophisticated) mathematical framework.

The first chapters of the book describe the mathematical and physical structure of the so called *trace dynamics*: the dynamical variables of the theory are noncommuting matrices $q_r(t) \equiv [q_r(t)]_{ij}$, where i and j denote the matrix elements — e.g. the analog of the classical Klein-Gordon scalar field $\phi(x,t)$ is a matrix field $[\phi(x,t)]_{ij}$ — whose dynamics is formulated in terms of a trace Lagrangian and trace Hamiltonian generalizing the classical Lagrangian and Hamiltonian formalism to a phase space of noncommuting variables; contrary to quantum mechanics, no a priori commutation relations between the matrices are assumed. The relevant mathematical tools and properties of trace dynamics are described: cyclic identities, operator derivatives, generalized Poisson brackets, conserved quantities; the extension to supersymmetric theories is discussed.

After these mathematical preliminaries, the discussion gets directly to the core. The statistical mechanics of the trace dynamics is set up: the analog of the classical Liouville theorem is proven, the canonical ensemble is analyzed, showing how average quantities can be computed. The author next shows how under plausible assumptions an effective theory stems from the statistical mechanics of the canonical ensemble, which is equivalent to quantum mechanics: the key idea is that global unitary invariance implies the existence of a conserved Noether charge, the equipartition of which gives rise to the canonical algebra of quantum mechanics. More specifically, the effective variables-matrices $q_{\text{reff}}(t)$ and effective conjugate momenta-matrices $p_{\text{reff}}(t)$ of the emerging theory are shown to evolve under a unitary dynamics and to satisfy the quantum commutation relations, with the constant appearing in the commutation relations identified with $\hbar$. This is the crucial claim of the entire book: quantization is *not* obtained in the standard way by promoting each degree of freedom $[q_r(t)]_{ij}$ and its conjugate momentum $[p_r(t)]_{ij}$ to quantum operators satisfying specific commutation relations. On the contrary, quantization naturally *emerges* from the statistical mechanics of the underlying dynamics: the quantum-like dynamical variables $q_{\text{reff}}(t)$ and $p_{\text{reff}}(t)$ are the result of thermodynamic averages over functions of the true variables $q_r(t)$ and $p_r(t)$.

And there is still something more. In the final part of the book the author considers the effects of statistical fluctuations around the averages and the result he gets is quite surprising. While thermodynamic averages give rise to the quantum framework, i.e. basically to the usual Schrödinger equation, fluctuations around the averages show up as a stochastic modification of the Schrödinger dynamics precisely of the type considered within the context of spontaneous collapse models. According to these models there is a unique dynamical equation both for microscopic and macroscopic systems: in the microscopic case, the dynamics practically reduces to standard quantum mechanics, while in the macroscopic case it reproduces classical mechanics and in particular predicts that in measurement-like situations wavefunctions of macroscopic measuring systems do not remain in a superposition of different states corresponding to the different outcomes, but spontaneously reduce to just one state, with a probability which is almost identical to the Born probability rule, as predicted by the postulate of wavepacket reduction. It

is important to stress that here the reduction process is not just an ad hoc mechanism which is put in by hand to avoid embarrassing macroscopic superpositions, but is embodied in the modified Schrödinger equation. Note also that the author provides an explanation for the origin of the noisy terms which are responsible for the reduction process.

The goal of the entire book is now reached and the emerging physical picture is the following: physical systems — this is the ontology suggested by the theory — are represented by matrices with no a priori commutativity properties, whose dynamics, which in general is neither unitary nor local, should describe all physical phenomena. The quantum mechanical behavior of microscopic systems is recovered as a result of the thermodynamical analysis of the fundamental dynamics; the emerging quantum dynamics is governed by a modified stochastic Schrödinger equation which reproduces the standard Schrödinger evolution at the microscopic level, but at the same time implies that macroscopic objects are described by wavefunctions which are localized in space and obey the classical laws of motion, avoiding in this way the measurement problem of quantum mechanics.

Needless to say, there is still much work to be done and technical and general questions to answer: in particular, a candidate model fulfilling all the assumptions which lead to the emergence of quantum theory out of the statistical mechanics of trace dynamics has not been identified yet; the connection between the formalism and our perceptions about physical objects needs to be analyzed in greater detail.

To conclude, the book describes in detail a rich mathematical framework out of which a new physical description of nature can emerge. The chapters are well organized; the presentation is clear, rigorous, very attractive, and accessible to mathematical as well as theoretical physicists. It is recommended to everyone who wants to learn more about the fascinating field of the foundations of physics and the continuing efforts scientists are making to formulate a clear and coherent picture of physical phenomena.